

VZCZCXRO0835  
OO RUEHAST  
DE RUCNDT #1860/01 2691605  
ZNR UUUUU ZZH  
O 261605Z SEP 06  
FM USMISSION USUN NEW YORK  
TO RUEHC/SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 0273  
INFO RUEHGG/UN SECURITY COUNCIL COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE  
RUEHXX/ARAB ISRAELI COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE  
RUEHEE/ARAB LEAGUE COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE  
RUEHZL/EUROPEAN POLITICAL COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE  
RUCNISL/ISLAMIC COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE

UNCLAS SECTION 01 OF 04 USUN NEW YORK 001860

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE  
SIPDIS

E.O. 12958: N/A  
TAGS: [PREL](#) [UNSC](#) [KPKO](#) [KPAL](#) [IS](#) [LE](#)  
SUBJECT: LUKEWARM UNSC RESPONSE TO ANNAN'S 30 DAY REPORT ON  
LEBANON AND ISRAEL

USUN NEW Y 00001860 001.2 OF 004

¶1. (SBU) Summary. During closed UNSC consultations on September 18, UN Secretary-General Annan outlined his one-month report on the implementation of UNSCR 1701, which led to a cessation of hostilities between Israel and Hizballah, and reviewed the results of his recent visit to the region. Praising progress achieved on the implementation of the resolution as "historic," Annan welcomed the deployment of Lebanese Armed Forces to southern Lebanon and said he expected Israel would withdraw completely once UNIFIL reaches a "credible" troop strength of 5,000 by the end of September. Drawing attention to the problem of unexploded ordinance, he called on Israel to hand over all maps of land mines in its possession. He said he was doing "all possible" to secure the release of the abducted Israeli soldiers, including the appointment of a facilitator.

¶2. (SBU) Summary, cont'd. Turning to the request made of him by UNSCR 1701 to develop specific proposals to implement provisions of the Ta'if Accords and UNSCRs 1559 and 1680, Annan asserted that disarmament of Hizballah could only be achieved through an internal Lebanese political dialogue. He expressed hope that neighboring states would cooperate in this regard and respect the arms embargo established in 1701, but offered no details. Annan reported that SARG President Asad had informed him of Syria's intention to go ahead with the delineation of the Syrian-Lebanese border. In closing, Annan argued that long-term peace in the Middle East could only be achieved by addressing all tracks, including the Israeli-Palestinian and the Israeli-Syrian conflicts. In response to requests by member states for more specific suggestions on next steps and timelines for implementation of 1701, Annan deferred to the concerned parties, including Israel, on issues related to disputed borders. With regard to implementation of the arms embargo, Annan suggested -- in a move pre-cooked with the French -- that the UNSC consider establishing a committee of experts to monitor compliance with 1701's arms embargo, and added a "general appeal" to all member states to comply with the resolution.

¶3. (SBU) Summary, cont'd. Although Qatar and Russia welcomed the SYG's report and his presentation to the Council, most other delegations joined P-3 delegations in asking tough questions about the report and emphasizing the need for an action plan to ensure implementation of its provisions. Harkening back to the Hizballah cross-border raid that precipitated the crisis, Ambassador Bolton underscored the need for disarmament and strict respect for 1701's arms embargo. Turning to Sheba'a Farms, he read aloud from the UNSC's Presidential Statement of June 18, 2000 to emphasize that the Council had already determined that Israel had

withdrawn from all of Lebanon. French PR de la Sabliere asked for a timetable for the steps necessary for Syria and Lebanon to delineate their common border, including Sheba'a Farms, and to establish diplomatic relations. He also asked about a plan for disarmament of militias, including Palestinian militias in Lebanon. The French and British PRs expressed hope that the proposals requested of the SYG in OP 10 -- relating to Ta'if and UNSCR 1559 and 1680 implementation -- would be forthcoming in the SYG's next report on the implementation of UNSCR 1559 (due on October 19, 2006). Several other delegations, including China, Denmark, Japan, and Argentina, echoed the need for a timeline for the implementation of UNSCR 1701. End Summary.

Annan Briefs the Council  
-----

14. (SBU) Reviewing his report on the implementation of UNSCR 1701 after one month and his recent visit to the region, SYG Annan welcomed the continuing cessation of hostilities and praised the deployment of LAF to southern Lebanon as "historic." Noting that UNIFIL would comprise 5,000 troops by the end of September, Annan stated his expectation that this "credible" force would allow the IDF to withdraw completely from Lebanon per his understanding with Israeli PM Olmert. Praising tripartite cooperation, he suggested that UNIFIL, IDF, and LAF might raise the level of representation at future tripartite meetings to the top military leaders on all sides. Annan expressed satisfaction that measures to improve the security of Lebanon's borders, including the creation of an interim UNIFIL maritime task force and deployment of German experts to the Beirut airport, had enabled Israel to lift its blockade of Lebanon. In order to achieve a full return to normalcy, however, Annan called on Israel to hand over all maps of landmines and other unexploded ordnance in Lebanon. He also welcomed the support of the international community for Lebanon's recovery. He

USUN NEW Y 00001860 002.2 OF 004

said he was doing "all possible" to secure the release of abducted IDF soldiers, including appointing a facilitator to work with both sides, but also noted that his interlocutors in the region had emphasized the need to resolve the situation of Lebanese prisoners in Israel.

15. (SBU) Turning to the tasks assigned him by UNSCR 1701, SYG Annan argued that agreement in principle by Israel and Lebanon to the elements in OP 8 of the resolution had to be consolidated, and pledged to report back to the Council "in due course" on this issue. On the request in OP 10 that the SYG develop proposals to implement the relevant provisions of the Ta'if Accords and UNSCRs 1559 and 1680, Annan asserted that disarmament of Hizballah could only be accomplished through an internal Lebanese political dialogue. He expressed hope that Lebanon would address this issue "soon" and that neighboring states would cooperate in this regard, but offered no further details. Annan urged all member states to comply with the arms embargo established under OP 15, and noted that UNIFIL had set up a maritime task force to help secure Lebanon's coast at the GOL's request. Turning last but with emphasis to the need to secure a broader peace in the Middle East, Annan argued that long-term peace would only be possible after the issue of occupied Palestinian territories and the Golan Heights is addressed. It is now time, he said, to focus intently on getting the Israelis and Palestinians back to the negotiating table.

16. (SBU) During his summary and his subsequent response to P5 interventions, Annan addressed the issue of disputed borders. He reported that during his recent visit to Syria, Assad had informed him that Syria is prepared to go ahead with delineation of the Syrian-Lebanese border (but provided no calendar for such action). On the issue of Sheba'a Farms, he acknowledged prior determination that Israel had fully withdrawn from Lebanon, but noted that Syria and Lebanon are free to make new arrangements. In this regard, he recalled

Lebanese Prime Minister Siniora's Seven-Point Plan, which calls for Sheba'a Farms to be placed under UN trusteeship until the sovereignty of the territory is conclusively defined. He said the UN is carefully studying all "paths" to resolution of this conflict, as well as their implications.

#### Russia and Qatar Generally Satisfied

-----

17. (SBU) Qatar and Russia welcomed the SYG's report on 1701 implementation and endorsed many of its conclusions. Characterizing the report as "excellent and comprehensive," the Qatari delegate objected to the continued presence of Israeli forces inside Lebanon and IAF overflights of Lebanese territory as "clear violations" of the Blue Line. He echoed the SYG's sentiments that disarmament of Hizballah could only take place through an internal Lebanese political process, but added that this process must conclude with Lebanon regaining full sovereignty over all of its land, including Sheba'a Farms. The Qatari delegate cautioned that a full cease-fire could only take hold once Israel hands over to the UN all maps of land mines in south Lebanon that it possesses. He characterized diplomatic relations between Lebanon and Syria as an issue of sovereignty that must be left to the two countries, and suggested that the issue of Lebanese and Israeli prisoners be dealt with through the International Committee of the Red Cross. Russian PR Churkin averred that the SYG's analysis "is to a great extent in line with Russia's," and lamented the "paralysis of the peace process" and the absence of a "balanced, comprehensive" approach to the Middle East. He expressed support for the GOL's intention to address disarmament of Hizballah through political dialogue, and praised GOL PM Siniora's idea that Sheba'a Farms be placed under UN trusteeship until its status is determined, even suggesting that this approach could be used to resolve the issue of the Golan Heights. Churkin observed that Lebanon and Syria could only improve their bilateral relationship without "unjustified" outside pressure.

#### Others Offer Lukewarm Praise and Tough Questions

-----

18. (SBU) Noting that President Bush would address the issue of Lebanon during his speech to the UNGA, Ambassador Bolton limited his remarks to four main points. First, he observed that the conflict had begun because Hizballah had crossed the Blue Line without provocation to kill and abduct Israeli soldiers. Second, Ambassador Bolton averred that Hizballah's status as a state within a state would continue to pose a threat to Israeli and Lebanese security until the terrorist

USUN NEW Y 00001860 003.2 OF 004

group is disarmed. Third, he emphasized that all member states must take seriously UNSCR 1701's requirement that Hizballah not be re-armed by strictly adhering to the arms embargo created by the resolution. Fourth, observing that comments about Sheba'a Farms were taking on a "Lewis Carroll"-type quality, the Ambassador read aloud the section of the UNSC's June 18, 2000 Presidential Statement (PRST) that "endorsed the work done by the UN... including the SYG's conclusion that as of 16 June 2000 Israel has withdrawn its forces from Lebanon in accordance with resolution 425..." The Council had repeatedly reaffirmed this PRST in subsequent SC resolutions, Ambassador Bolton recalled, and could not simply ignore the statement now when dealing with the Sheba'a Farms issue.

19. (SBU) While commending the efforts of SYG Annan and the Secretariat to secure the cessation of hostilities and

SIPDIS

expeditiously establish the expanded UNIFIL force, France and the UK joined the USG in offering only lukewarm praise for the report and asking the SYG specific questions about how to ensure implementation of the key provisions of UNSCR 1701. French PR de la Sabliere asked for a timetable for the steps

necessary for Syria and Lebanon to delineate their common border and establish diplomatic relations. In a set piece pre-arranged with the SYG, de la Sabliere asked Annan whether there should be a follow-up to ensure implementation of the arms embargo established in UNSCR 1701 (to which Annan later replied that the SC could consider setting up a committee of experts to monitor implementation of the arms embargo). The French PR also expressed hope that the proposals requested of the SYG in OP 10 -- relating to Ta'if and UNSCR 1559 and 1680 implementation, including resolution of the Sheba'a Farms issue -- would be forthcoming in the SYG's next report on the implementation of UNSCR 1559 (due on October 19, 2006). British PR Jones-Parry agreed that the international community had registered a "huge achievement" in terms of progress on 1701 implementation but emphasized that much remains to be done. Singling out the arms embargo and the importance of securing Lebanon's land border with Syria, Jones-Parry said he looked forward to the SYG's recommendations per OP 10 of 1701.

¶10. (SBU) Several other delegations echoed many of the points raised by the P-3. While calling on the international community to strengthen UNIFIL's deployment and urging Israel to withdraw completely from south Lebanon, China also said it shared France's view that UNSCR 1701 implementation requires a timetable. Seizing on the SYG's statement that "almost all" of Lebanon's neighbors had offered to cooperate in implementing 1701, Denmark asked which countries had not cooperated. Arguing that Syria and Lebanon must establish diplomatic relations, the Danish PR also expressed hope that GOL PM Siniora and SARG President Asad would soon meet. She also called on Iran and Syria to live up to their commitments to respect the arms embargo under 1701. Noting that the SYG's report did not contain much detail, Argentina expressed hope the 1559 report would present specific recommendations to deal with Sheba'a Farms, disarmament, and respect for the arms embargo and the Blue Line. Japan and Slovakia agreed that timelines were needed for disarmament and Sheba'a Farms. Both delegations also underscored the importance of the immediate release of the abducted Israeli soldiers.

#### Annan Offers Little in Response

-----

¶11. (SBU) Taking the floor again after Qatar, France, China, Russia and the U.S. had spoken (given his commitments elsewhere during the General Debate), Annan promised to report to the Council if further progress on 1701 implementation is achieved. But he added that on certain issues -- such as Sheba'a Farms and border delineation -- progress depends on Lebanon, Syria, and Israel. Referring to his report to the Council endorsed in the June 18, 2000 PRST, SYG Annan said the delineation of the Blue Line did not preclude other arrangements between Syria and Lebanon that might change the status of Sheba'a Farms. Israel had a role to play in this process as well, he noted, because it still occupies the area but has laid no permanent territorial claim to it. If Sheba'a becomes Lebanese, Annan suggested, the UNSC would have to review the situation again.

¶12. (SBU) On disarmament, Annan argued that the Lebanese must agree to a process that accomplishes more than the National Dialogue, given that the National Dialogue consensus on disarming Palestinian groups outside the camps had yet to be fulfilled. He noted that the Lebanese and Syrians had put

USUN NEW Y 00001860 004.2 OF 004

forward no calendar to address issues in their bilateral relationship, but recalled that Asad had made a commitment in principle to meet Siniora. Annan also noted Asad's announcement that he would deploy an additional battalion of Syrian soldiers to police the Lebanese border and would accept German assistance to ensure its security.

¶13. (SBU) Responding to French PR de la Sabliere's question about follow-up mechanisms to ensure implementation of the

arms embargo, Annan noted that the UNSC has often created panels of experts and sent them to visit the countries in question to monitor adherence to sanctions regimes. Aside from issuing a general call to member states to respect their obligations under 1701, Annan opined that creating a panel of experts was an option for the Council. (Note: UNSC committees work on the basis of consensus. Qatar, for example, would therefore have an effective veto over the work of a panel of experts even though it lacks that veto in the broader Council. End Note.)

¶14. (SBU) Responding to member state interventions after SYG Annan left, Under Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Jean-Marie Guehenno clarified that Annan's said that "almost all" of Lebanon's neighbors had offered to cooperate in implementing 1701 because not all had publicly and explicitly affirmed their commitments. Guehenno stressed that all neighbors had privately assured the SYG of their support, however. Guehenno also noted that the Secretariat could propose no timeline for Hizballah's disarmament because the process must be driven by the Lebanese.  
BOLTON